



**CASCADE CITY
PLANNING & ZONING COMMISSION
Special Meeting Minutes
Tuesday, February 26, 2019
Cascade City Hall**

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Lori Hunter. Vice Chairman Ron Brown and Commission Members Heather Perkins, Adam Mapp were present. Candice White was absent. Quorum present. City Staff Carrie Rushby was also present.

NEW BUSINESS – ACTION ITEMS

Outdoor Nighttime Lighting Ordinance Proposal
Public Hearing

Chairman Hunter introduced the application and opened up the public hearing.

Chairman Hunter asked Carrie for the staff report. Carrie read the staff report.

Chairman Hunter asked the applicants if they would like to give the presentation.

Melanie Hamilton Munson, along with Chuck Smith (telephonically, as he had some medical issues and isn't able to participate physically) and Shauna Arnold are representing the Valley County Astronomical Society for the Outdoor Nighttime Lighting Ordinance. Ms. Munson introduced a short video called "Losing the Dark Sky" by the International Dark Skies Association. A second video was shown, "Colorado Town Goes Dark". She said it explains how one small, rural town in the mountains in Colorado went dark sky and truly changed and brought in astronomers from all over. This town is very similar to Cascade.

Ms. Munson said the reason for promoting this is at this time is they want to protect the sky now instead of having to try to take it back after the fact and reclaim the dark skies. She believes we have a duty to protect the future generation to be able to see and appreciate what we've been gifted with here in Valley County and Cascade.

Ms. Munson continued, "we know that Cascade already has a noise ordinance and that requires the noise not extend beyond your property boundary". They

are asking for something very similar, only in lighting. Lights should not regularly extend beyond one's property boundary. Desired lights have the International Dark Sky Association (IDA) approval. Home Depot, Hampton Bay lighting and GE are some of the few examples of companies with IDA approved lighting. Changing outdoor lights to motion sensors will improve security. Safety saves money. They are energy efficient. Valley County Astronomical Society is going to seek grant funding to help purchase lighting for individuals who may not be able to afford it themselves. Most lights can simply be brought into compliance by re-directing the fixture, replacing the bulb with a shielded bulb, or shielding completely itself.

Ms. Munson added, this is a complaint-based enforcement and education driven, just like many of the ordinances.

Ms. Munson asked Chuck to explain about the Kelvin color temperature scale and what the colors mean.

Ms. Munson told the commissioners about the Astronomy nights and how they try to put this on once a year to do some star viewing with the kids. Shauna advised that State Parks has set aside area on their property for viewing pads. They hope that down the road they will have an outdoor observatory as seen in the Colorado video.

Ms. Munson asked for questions, hearing none, Chairman Hunter said she will open it up for public comment and advised the applicant that they can re-butt or respond.

Chairman Hunter asked if there were any proponents or those in favor and asked them to state their name and address for the record.

Charles Hower, 518 Skyline Drive, speaking in favor of the proposal. He continued, "My interest is very much personal because I have been a long-time stargazer". He said, "It's much easier to see stars now that the glare from the former Boise Cascade mill that has been lost". he said. "It was a great economic loss for Cascade, but it was also a very good example of what can happen with sky glow." Again, he is in favor of the proposal. He feels it would be a benefit to the community. It would make it the community more attractive to visitors as well as the people who live here. Mr. Hower introduced his wife who was wearing a Dark Sky t-shirt from Stanley Idaho. Mr. Hower said, "certainly we should be able to be as progressive as Stanley, Idaho is."

Cheyenne Jedry, 107 Finn Church, McCall, teaches at Cascade High School. She and some students joined the Astronomical Society a couple of years ago over the summer to observe what we were studying in class. This last fall they were unable to host the Astronomy nights due to weather. Instead, a student

hosted one at their house in Cascade. Preserving this for educational purposes both in and outside the classroom is absolutely credible.

Melanie Hamilton Munson spoke as a realtor and said that she has had clients who refused properties within Cascade because of the lighting. One of the properties was in Leisure Time actually. Due to the close proximity of the overhead lighting, they declined to consider the property. Another property is near the school and across where the buses park and there is a big light and a street light that is not shielded, that property was also refused.

Chairman Hunter asked if there was anyone present that is un-committed/neutral.

Hearing none, Chairman Hunter asked if there was anyone present that is opposed.

Bill McFarlane, caretaker at Leisure Time. He can't speak for the park directly but he can speak from input from park members. He feels that businesses will lose business if they can't have their lights on at night.

He said he care takes 379 lots in Leisure Time, 300 owners. The majority of them will complain if the street lights aren't working because of security and safety. There are animals, people, and the fact that they want to be able to see. Most of the clientele are of a more mature age. They need to see what's going on from one place to another.

He feels a person can drive down the road five minutes and see the dark sky. He does not feel that it helps the City as a whole.

Sally Brown, 514 Sawyer, F33, likes the concept of the night sky, but ask Donna Tilden how much business she lost when her sign wasn't illuminated. Another thing is the expense. For a homeowner it may only cost \$35 but for a business it will cost thousands of dollars to fix the lighting to bring it in compliance. What if it was to be re-worded so that as maintenance needs to be done or as things need to be updated, at that time it would be brought into compliance using dark sky compliant materials. As it is right now, you have three (3) years to comply whether you have the money or not. Leisure Time just spent approximately \$9,000 last year putting in all new lighting, upgrading the security lights around the building and park. For them to go back in and upgrade it will cost \$2,000/per fixture and there are 20 security lights. Ms. Brown suggested again to modify the proposal so that it is in compliance as the business needs to change or update them.

Troy Huckaby, 115 Par Drive, understands and respects the intent of the outdoor nighttime lighting ordinance. He enjoys the dark sky and loves to see the stars. He has openly opposed this particular ordinance in the past and still opposes it in its current form. He feels that it willfully takes away property owners light. He had many suggested edits.

Hearing no further testimony, Chairman Hunter asked if the Astronomical Society would like to rebuttal or respond to any of the comments that were heard.

Shauna Arnold responded saying as far lighting and security – the more lights and lights that aren't downward, doesn't mean more security. Intentional lighting is more secure than increased lighting, as well as visually, being able to see better.

Chairman Hunter asked the commission if they had any questions for the applicant. Commissioner Mapp said he did not. Commissioner Perkins said it looks pretty straight forward.

Troy Huckaby asked if opposition gets a chance to rebut.

Chairman Hunter advised Mr. Huckaby that if there is something else he'd like to say, the applicant will get a chance to rebut again.

Mr. Huckaby said if you ask Valley County how they are enforcing their lighting ordinance they've adopted their answer would be it is a complaint-based enforcement. He continued, if that is what the City is wanting to adopt, a complaint-based enforcement then to write it in the ordinance. He said, "don't say it's a mandatory 36 months". He said it doesn't say complaint-based enforcement.

Chairman Hunter asked the applicant if they would like to respond. The applicant said they did not.

Chairman Hunter closed the public hearing for discussion.

Vice Chairman Brown felt there should be a way to deal with the cost. Allowing the cost to be spread out over time e.g. when a fixture wears out, then replace it with a compliant fixture. This way, people do not have to change everything all at once. In discussing the lighted exempted signs, Chairman Hunter has a concern that a business may have been missed. She said this was an attempt to add everybody. Vice Chairman Brown suggested putting a note in the water bills addressing businesses to say if the business would like their sign to be on the exempted "existing sign" list in the lighting ordinance to contact the city. A time limit for the businesses to be added to the addendum was suggested. Chairman Brown feels if the businesses got involved, they would be salesmen for instead of automatic opponents.

Another concern for Chairman Hunter is regarding the change of ownership. She said her understanding with grandfathering is that it is always with land use not ownership. If for instance, Tackle Toms, if the ownership were to change into a completely different business then they would have to bring the signs into compliance.

Chairman Hunter suggested they took a look at 2-4-3 B. Existing Lighting for commercial and residential. She said this was a stickler when it went before City Council the first time whether or not things should be grandfathered in or they have to get everything changed out in 36 months. Vice Chairman Brown restated that he feels it shouldn't have to be changed until it has to be repaired or replaced and put a monetary amount on the repair. He continued, in time, most of the lights will be obsolete and therefore will have to be upgraded. Commissioner Mapp reiterates what Vice Chairman Brown recommended. The commission recommended to remove the paragraph "Seasonal holiday lighting is allowed from November 15 to February 15. Seasonal holiday lights must be turned off at 11:00 p.m. unless they are compliant to the standards of these rules" as well as taking out the 36-month time line to be in compliance.

Chairman Hunter asked city staff to make the changes so the commission can take a final look at the proposal prior to making a recommendation.

Vice Chairman Brown made a motion to table the current outdoor nighttime lighting ordinance proposal to allow staff time to edit the existing proposal and bring it back before the commission on March 4, 2019 for a recommendation. Commissioner Perkins seconded the motion. Roll call: LH yes; HP yes; AM yes; RB yes.

ADJOURNMENT

Having no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:25 pm.

Respectfully submitted,



Carrie Rushby, Deputy Clerk

Approved:



Lori Hunter, Chairman